

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

IN RE GOOGLE DIGITAL ADVERTISING  
ANTITRUST LITIGATION

*This Document Relates To:  
All Cases*

Case No. 1:21-md-03010 (PKC)

**STIPULATION AND ~~PROPOSED~~ ORDER TO DEFER EXPERT  
DISCOVERY CONCERNING EQUITABLE REMEDIES**

Defendants Google LLC, Alphabet Inc., and YouTube, LLC (collectively “Defendants”) and Plaintiffs Inform Inc., Associated Newspapers Ltd., Mail Media Inc., Gannett Co., Inc., Michael Stellman, the putative Publisher Class Plaintiffs, and the putative Advertiser Class Plaintiffs (collectively “Plaintiffs,” and together with Defendants, the “Parties”) stipulate as follows:

WHEREAS, certain Plaintiffs in this MDL are seeking equitable, injunctive, and/or structural relief (for simplicity, referred to together as “equitable remedies”) in addition to monetary relief.

WHEREAS, any finding on liability will inform what discovery, if any, is appropriate regarding Plaintiffs’ equitable remedies.

WHEREAS, the Parties agree that deferring expert discovery relating to equitable remedies will promote judicial economy by allowing the Parties and the Court to (i) avoid spending time and resources addressing matters that ultimately may be unnecessary, depending on the outcomes of the actions included within this multidistrict litigation; and (ii) in the event of a liability finding, tailor any expert discovery and litigation on equitable remedies.

WHEREAS, courts in other antitrust cases have provided for post-trial expert discovery on equitable remedies. *See, e.g.,* Order at 3, *United States v. Google LLC*, Case No. 23-cv-00108

(E.D. Va. July 11, 2023), ECF No. 283 (establishing process for plaintiffs, if they prevail at trial, to indicate “what equitable relief [they] intend to pursue” based on the liability finding and for the parties to “exchang[e] expert reports addressing the specific equitable remedy or remedies being sought”); Order on Bifurcation at 1, *Texas v. Google LLC*, Case No. 20-cv-00957 (E.D. Tex. Aug. 30, 2024), ECF No. 610 (“If there is a liability finding, the Court will order separate proceedings regarding equitable remedies”); Minute Entry at 1-2, *In re Google Play Store Antitrust Litig.*, Case No. 3:21-md-02981 (N.D. Cal. May 24, 2024), ECF No. 978 (ordering post-trial expert discovery to determine “an appropriate injunctive remedy” based on the liability finding); Order to Bifurcate Proceedings at 2, *United States v. Google LLC*, Case No. 1:20-cv-03010 (D.D.C. Dec. 6, 2021), ECF No. 264 (deferring “expert discovery and testimony . . . regarding particular remedies” until post-trial remedies phase); Joint Scheduling Order at 2, *FTC v. Meta Platforms, Inc.*, 20-cv-03590 (D.D.C. Mar. 3, 2022), ECF No. 103 (deferring “any additional discovery to facilitate a remedy phase” until after the liability phase of proceedings).

NOW THEREFORE, Defendants and Plaintiffs, through their respective counsel, hereby stipulate as follows:

1. Expert discovery relating solely to equitable remedies is hereby deferred until after findings have been made with respect to liability, to the extent necessary based on any remaining claims at that time, or until otherwise ordered.
2. The expert reports currently due to be served on October 4, 2024 (Plaintiffs’ opening reports), December 13, 2024 (Defendants’ responsive reports), and January 17, 2025 (Plaintiffs’ rebuttal reports), *see* ECF No. 880, shall not address issues relating solely to equitable remedies.

3. Nothing in this stipulation shall be deemed an admission by any Party as to any issue relating to liability or remedies, nor be deemed to alter the burden of proof, persuasion, or production as to any issue relating to liability or remedies. Plaintiffs and Defendants each expressly reserve all rights with respect to all issues relating to liability and remedies.
4. This stipulation shall have no impact on the ability of any Plaintiff (including its experts) to participate, or Defendants' ability to oppose such participation, in any remedy-phase discovery that may occur in any other pending case.

**IT IS SO STIPULATED AND ORDERED.**

  
Hon. P. Kevin Castel, U.S.D.J.

(7)  
Dated: October 3, 2024

/s/ SERINA M. VASH

SERINA M. VASH  
New York Bar No.: 2773448  
svash@hermanjones.com  
HERMAN JONES LLP  
153 Central Avenue, # 131  
Westfield, NJ 07090  
(404) 504-6516

JOHN C. HERMAN (*pro hac vice*)  
jherman@hermanjones.com  
HERMAN JONES LLP  
3424 Peachtree Road, N.E., Suite 1650  
Atlanta, GA 30326

/s/ Craig M. Reiser

Craig M. Reiser  
Daniel Bitton  
Denise L. Plunkett  
Eva H. Yung  
Claire L. Haws  
AXINN, VELTROP & HARKRIDER LLP  
114 West 47th Street  
New York, New York 10036  
Telephone: (212) 728-2200  
Fax: (212) 728-2201  
creiser@axinn.com  
dbitton@axinn.com  
dplunkett@axinn.com

(404) 504-6555  
(404) 504-6501 (fax)

eyung@axinn.com  
chaws@axinn.com

*Counsel for Plaintiff Inform Inc.*

/s/ John Thorne

John Thorne  
Daniel G. Bird  
Bethan R. Jones  
Christopher C. Goodnow  
Mark P. Hirschboeck  
Eliana Margo Pfeffer  
Eric J. Maier  
Sven E. Henningson  
Tiberius T. Davis  
Jonathan I. Liebman  
Kyle B. Grigel  
KELLOGG, HANSEN, TODD, FIGEL  
& FREDERICK, P.L.L.C.  
1615 M Street NW  
Suite 400  
Washington, DC 20036  
Tel.: (202) 326-7900  
Fax: (202) 326-7999  
jthorne@kellogghansen.com  
dbird@kellogghansen.com  
bjones@kellogghansen.com  
cgoodnow@kellogghansen.com  
mhirschboeck@kellogghansen.com  
epfeffer@kellogghansen.com  
emaier@kellogghansen.com  
shenningson@kellogghansen.com  
tdavis@kellogghansen.com  
jliebman@kellogghansen.com  
kgrigel@kellogghansen.com

*Counsel for Associated Newspapers Ltd.,  
Mail Media, Inc., and Gannett Co., Inc.*

Bradley Justus (*pro hac vice*)  
James K. Hunsberger  
AXINN, VELTROP & HARKRIDER LLP  
1901 L Street NW  
Washington, DC 20036  
Telephone: (202) 912-4700  
Fax: (202) 912-4701  
bjustus@axinn.com  
jhunsberger@axinn.com

Caroline P. Boisvert (*pro hac vice*)  
AXINN, VELTROP & HARKRIDER LLP  
90 State House Square  
Hartford, Connecticut 06103  
Telephone: (860) 275-8100  
Fax: (860) 275-8101  
cboisvert@axinn.com

Justina K. Sessions  
FRESHFIELDS BRUCKHAUS  
DERINGER US LLP  
855 Main Street  
Redwood City, CA 94063  
Telephone: (650) 618-9250  
Fax: (650) 461-8276  
justina.sessions@freshfields.com

Eric Mahr  
Robert J. McCallum  
FRESHFIELDS BRUCKHAUS  
DERINGER US LLP  
700 13th Street NW, 10th Floor  
Washington, DC 20005  
Telephone: (202) 777-4500  
Fax: (202) 777-4555  
eric.mahr@freshfields.com  
rob.mccallum@freshfields.com

*Counsel for Defendants Google LLC,  
Alphabet Inc., and YouTube, LLC*

/s/ Tina Wolfson

Tina Wolfson  
Robert Ahdoot  
Ted Maya  
AHDoot & WOLFSON, PC  
2600 West Olive Avenue  
Burbank, CA 91505  
Tel: (888) 333-8996  
twolfson@ahdootwolfson.com  
rahdoot@ahdootwolfson.com  
tmaya@ahdootwolfson.com

*Counsel for Plaintiff Michael Stellman and the  
Putative Class*

/s/ David Boies

David Boies  
dboies@bsflp.com  
BOIES SCHILLER FLEXNER LLP  
333 Main Street  
Armonk, NY 10504  
Telephone: (914) 749-8200

*Lead Counsel for the Publisher Class*

Philip C. Korologos  
pkorologos@bsflp.com  
Luke Williams  
lwilliams@bsflp.com  
BOIES SCHILLER FLEXNER LLP  
55 Hudson Yards, 20th Floor  
New York, NY 10001  
Telephone: (212) 446-2300

Mark C. Mao  
mmao@bsflp.com  
Sean P. Rodriguez  
srodriguez@bsflp.com  
BOIES SCHILLER FLEXNER LLP  
44 Montgomery Street, 41st Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94104  
Telephone: (415) 293-6820  
Sabria A. McElroy  
smcelroy@bsflp.com

**BOIES SCHILLER FLEXNER LLP**  
401 E. Las Olas Blvd., Suite 1200  
Fort Lauderdale, FL 33301  
Telephone: (954) 377-4216

**Izaak Earnhardt**  
iearnhardt@bsflp.com  
**BOIES SCHILLER FLEXNER LLP**  
1401 New York Ave NW, 11th Floor  
Washington, DC 20005  
Telephone: (202) 237-2727

**George A. Zelcs**  
gzelcs@koreintillery.com  
**Randall P. Ewing**  
rewing@koreintillery.com  
**Marc A. Wallenstein**  
mwallenstein@koreintillery.com  
**Ryan A. Cortazar**  
rcortazar@koreintillery.com  
**KOREIN TILLERY LLC**  
205 North Michigan Avenue, Suite 1950  
Chicago, IL 60601  
Telephone: (312) 641-9750  
Fax: (312) 641-9751

**Christopher M. Burke**  
cburke@koreintillery.com  
**Walter W. Noss**  
wnoss@koreintillery.com  
**Yifan (Kate) Lv**  
klv@koreintillery.com  
**KOREIN TILLERY P.C.**  
707 Broadway, Suite 1410  
San Diego, CA 92101  
Telephone: (619) 625-5621  
Fax: (314) 241-3525

**Stephen M. Tillery**  
stillery@koreintillery.com  
**Michael E. Klenov**  
mklenov@koreintillery.com  
**Carol L. O'Keefe**  
cokeefe@koreintillery.com  
**Andrew Ellis**  
aellis@koreintillery.com

**KOREIN TILLERY LLC**  
505 North 7<sup>th</sup> Street, Suite 3600  
St. Louis, MO 63101  
Telephone: (314) 241-4844  
Fax: (314) 241-3525

**Eric L. Cramer**  
ecramer@bm.net  
**Michael C. Dell'Angelo**  
mdellangelo@bm.net  
**Caitlin G. Coslett**  
ccoslett@bm.net  
**Patrick F. Madden**  
pmadden@bm.net  
**Jeremy Gradwohl**  
jgradwohl@bm.net  
**BERGER MONTAGUE PC**  
1818 Market St., Suite 3600  
Philadelphia, PA 19103  
Telephone: (215) 875-3000

**Robert E. Litan**  
rlitan@bm.net  
**BERGER MONTAGUE PC**  
2001 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Suite 300  
Washington, DC 20006  
Telephone: (202) 559-9745

*Interim Co-Lead Counsel for the Publisher  
Class*

/s/ Dena C. Sharp  
**Dena C. Sharp (pro hac vice)**  
**Jordan Elias (pro hac vice)**  
**Scott M. Grzenczyk (pro hac vice)**  
**Mikaela Bock (pro hac vice)**  
**GIRARD SHARP LLP**  
601 California Street, Suite 1400  
San Francisco, CA 94108  
Tel: (415) 981-4800  
Fax: (415) 981-4846  
dsharp@girardsharp.com  
jelias@girardsharp.com  
scottg@girardsharp.com

**mbock@girardsharp.com**

**Tina Wolfson (TW-1016)**  
**Theodore W. Maya (pro hac vice)**  
**AHDOOT & WOLFSON, PC**  
**2600 West Olive Ave., Suite 500**  
**Burbank, California 91505**  
**Tel.: (310) 474-9111**  
**Fax: (310) 474-8585**  
**twolfson@ahdootwolfson.com**  
**tmaya@ahdootwolfson.com**

***Interim Co-Lead Counsel for Advertiser  
Plaintiffs and the Proposed Advertiser Class***

**Jonathan L. Rubin (pro hac vice)**  
**MOGINRUBIN LLP**  
**2101 L Street, NW, Third Floor**  
**Washington, D.C. 20037**  
**(202) 630-0616**  
**jrubin@moginrubin.com**

**Daniel J. Mogin (pro hac vice)**  
**Timothy Z. LaComb (pro hac vice)**  
**MOGINRUBIN LLP**  
**4225 Executive Square, Suite 600**  
**La Jolla, CA 92037**  
**(619) 687-6611**  
**dmogin@moginrubin.com**  
**tlacomb@moginrubin.com**

***Counsel for Plaintiffs Cliffy Care and Kinin***

**Archana Tamoshunas (AT-3935)**  
**TAUS, CEBULASH & LANDAU, LLP**  
**123 William Street, Suite 1900A**  
**New York, NY 10038**  
**Tel.: (212) 931-0704**  
**Fax: (212) 931-0703**  
**atamoshunas@tcllaw.com**  
**April D. Lambert (pro hac vice)**  
**John D. Radice (JR 9033)**  
**RADICE LAW FIRM, PC**  
**475 Wall Street**



Princeton, NJ 08540  
Tel: (646) 245-8502  
Fax: (609) 385-0745  
alambert@radicelawfirm.com  
jradice@radicelawfirm.com

*Counsel for Plaintiff Hanson Law Office, as  
successor in-interest to Hanson Law Firm, PC*

Richard F. Lombardo (pro hac vice)  
Peter F. Rottgers (pro hac vice)  
SHAFFER LOMBARDO SHURIN  
2001 Wyandotte Street  
Kansas City, MO 64108  
(816) 931-0500  
rlombardo@sls-law.com  
prottgers@sls-law.com

*Counsel for Plaintiff Cliffy Care*

Jason S. Hartley (pro hac vice forthcoming)  
Jason M. Lindner (pro hac vice forthcoming)  
HARTLEY LLP  
101 W. Broadway, Ste 820  
San Diego, CA 92101  
(619) 400-5822  
hartley@hartleyllp.com  
lindner@hartleyllp.com

*Counsel for Plaintiff Kinin*